

Rate Affordability Task Force Meeting #6

Date: February 17, 2016

Time: 1:10 P.M. to 3:07 P.M.

Location: 1081 Woodrow Street, Cincinnati, Ohio 45204

Overview

The task force, appointed by Hamilton County Board of County Commissioners, held its fifth meeting to discuss rate structures for the Greater Cincinnati Metropolitan Sewer District (MSD). The task force, chaired by Madeira City Manager Thomas Moeller, includes 15 diverse members representing local governments, business owners, homeowners, renters, senior citizens, low-income residents, environmental groups, and non-profit organizations. The purpose of this task force is to provide the Commissioners with recommendations to mitigate ratepayer fee increases by April 2016.

Summary

For the sixth publicly-held meeting, 20 total individuals were present including the task force and non-task force members listed on the following page. To begin the meeting, Tom Moeller offered a quick welcoming including reminder regarding the task at hand. Next, a group discussion was facilitated by Steven Johns, Planning Services Administrator at Hamilton County Regional Planning. The current rate affordability ideas seen below were deliberated during this time. Please note that this list is not final and is subject to change. The two full documents used for this discussion may be seen online under the following: *Hamilton County MSD Strawman Supplement* and *Initiative Matrix v3*. Lastly, Tom Moeller concluded the task force meeting.

Next Meeting

At the conclusion of the meeting, the next Task Force assembly date was undetermined. Additional details will follow once the force agrees on a time to meet. During the next meeting, previous requested information will be provided and future recommendations will be deliberated. If there are any questions, feel free to contact Karen Ball by phone at 513-557-5972 or via email at Karen.Ball@hamilton-co.org.

Meeting Chronology

- Welcome by Thomas Moeller (1:10 - 1:12)
- Facilitated group refresher led by Steven Johns (1:13 – 3:05)
- Conclusion by Thomas Moeller (3:06 - 3:07)

Requested Information

1. Change previous requested information slides to display monthly, not quarterly, amounts
2. Run multifamily billings by meter size with minimum charge not including volume idea
3. How much of the base bill is for stormwater (inflow & infiltration)
4. How many people that use septic tanks contribute to stormwater yet do not pay for it
5. Total number of people that use septic tanks in Hamilton County
6. How many people qualify for Pip in Hamilton County or how many people are over 150% of poverty

Task Force Members Present

Name (Last, First)	Organization
Beck, Clark	Communities United for Action
Bernloehr, John	Cincinnati USA Regional Chamber
Burke, Suzanne	Council on Aging of Southwestern Ohio
Crane, Lucy	United Way of Greater Cincinnati
Kammer, Nancy	Greater Cincinnati Building Owners & Managers Association
Moeller, Thomas	City of Madeira
Morgan, Noel	Legal Aid Society of Southwest Ohio
Quarry, Mark	Cincinnati Area Board of Realtors
Russell, Christine	City of Springdale
Tassell, Charles	Greater Cincinnati-Northern Kentucky Apartment Association
Vonderhaar, Stiney	Hamilton County Municipal League
Wall, Marilyn	Sierra Club

Non-Task Force Members Present

Name (Last, First)	Organization
Anderson, David	Public Financial Management
Ball, Karen	Hamilton County MSD Compliance Coordinator
Christmann, Holly	Hamilton County Environmental Team
Fightmaster, Sean	Plante Moran, PLLC
Johns, Steven	Hamilton County Regional Planning
Knaus, Genny	Citizen
Kocoshis, Marie	City of Cincinnati Environmental Advisory Counsel
Metzmeyer, Mary	Communities United for Action

Current Rate Affordability Ideas

Idea #	Idea Category	Idea	Pluses	Minuses	Task Force Support
1	Billing & Rates	Monthly Payment as the Default	-Simple -Helps with how most people budget	-Small impact -No impact on rates -Some cost to GCWW/MSD	Currently Under Discussion
2	Billing & Rates	Reduce Residential Monthly Minimum Charge to Quarterly Divided by Three	-Savings of \$18/month for low usage households	-Cost	Currently Under Discussion
3	Billing & Rates	Pay by Amount Used (volume only)	-Equity -Helpful for small households	-Revenue volatility -Large users rate shock -Negative bond rating	No Longer in Discussion
4	Billing & Rates	Minimum Charge With No Minimum Volume Charge Included	-Equity -Helpful for small households	-How to pay for change	Currently Under Discussion
5	Billing & Rates	Multifamily to Meter Only	-Many low income households are in apartments -Already have estimated cost impact	-Large multifamily complexes already paying less per ccf than single family	Currently Under Discussion
6	Billing & Rates	Single Volume Charge	-Simple	-Impact on large users -no affordability impact	Currently Under Discussion
7	Inflow & Infiltration (Stormwater)	Tie Consent Decree Costs to Impervious Surface	-Equity -Incentivizes Private Action	-Marrying Stormwater District info with Stormwater Utility (SMU) info	Currently Under Discussion
8	Inflow & Infiltration (Stormwater)	Allocation of Unbilled Volume by Customer Class	-Equity, -Rate structure relates to problem	-Modeling? -Intuition is commercial users would pay more	Currently Under Discussion
9	Inflow & Infiltration (Stormwater)	Impervious Surface Assessment on Tax Bill	-Would help ensure that unsewered areas that contribute stormwater to MSD system are included in solution		Currently Under Discussion
10	Affordability Programs	Voluntary Donation Affordability Program	-Low cost	-Small impact -Dependent on donations -Need system to disperse	Currently Under Discussion
11	Affordability Programs	Customer Assistance Program	-Other models like Duke Energy	-Where does money come from to support programs?	Currently Under Discussion
12	Other	Lateral Line Insurance	-Helps on Customer Capital Cost	-Doesn't address monthly affordability problem	Currently Under Discussion
13	Other	Property Tax	-"New" revenue source -Proxy for stormwater problem?	-Septic tank users might balk	No Longer in Discussion
14	Other	Lobby in Support of Senate Bill	-"Other people's money" -Opportunity to work with other cities and states	-Chances of passage unknown	Currently Under Discussion

Additional Requests

1. Change previous requested information slides to display monthly, not quarterly, amounts
(Slide 6 from PowerPoint) (Requested by John Bernloehr)
2. Run multifamily billings by meter size with minimum charge not including volume idea
(Slide 7 from PowerPoint) (Requested by John Bernloehr)
3. How much of the base bill is for stormwater (inflow & infiltration)
(Requested by Charles Tassel)
4. How many people that use septic tanks contribute to stormwater yet do not pay for it
(Requested by Nancy Kammer)
5. Total number of people that use septic tanks in Hamilton County
(Requested by Marilyn Wall)
6. How many people qualify for Pip in Hamilton County or how many people are over 150% of poverty
(Requested by Noel Morgan)